A Friendly Reminder that AToL Is Really ANoL



C. Randal Linder University of Texas at Austin (currently the Program for Evolutionary Dynamics, Harvard University)

Main Points

- Reticulation (hybrid speciation and horizontal gene transfer/introgression) is so common in some groups that the AToL project should incorporate it from the outset.
- Detection and reconstruction of reticulation is in its infancy.
- Combined data analyses will require explicitly ruling out reticulation.
- Systematics will need to become more intimate with population genetics.

Unruly Nature

Whatever is not forbidden will occur.

-- Gerald Myers (ca 1980)

In Other Words

- If a set of genes can be brought together in a cell, survival and reproduction will be determined by the phenotype produced in the environment of the organism.
- If the organism can survive and reproduce as well as or better than its competitors, it "works" no matter the mating/process that produced it

Evidence of HGT in Bacteria

- Relatively large proportions of bacterial genomes appear to be subject to horizontal gene transfer.
- Recent evidence indicates there is probably a "core" set of genes that are unlikely to be involved in HGT (Daubin et al. 2003. Science 301:829).
- Can these low transfer genes be routinely identified and used for reconstruction?
 - Need to look in order to know

Hybrid Speciation in Eukaryotes

- Primarily found in plants, but also some fish and amphibians
 - Also in some reptiles but these are usually sterile asexual lineages.
 - What's up with fungi?
- Most recent estimates suggest that about 7% of new fern lineages have arisen by hybrid speciation and 3-4% of angiosperm lineages (Otto and Whitten. 2000. Annu. Rev. Genet. 34:40)

Current Methods for Detecting and Reconstructing Hybrid Speciation are in their Infancy



Phylogenetic Trees: Models, Methods, and Results

- Models of speciation: YES
- Models of sequence evolution: YES
- Tree distances and accuracy measures:
 YES
- Methods and optimization problems for tree inference: YES

Phylogenetic Networks: Models, Methods, and Results

- Just two years ago:
 - Models of speciation: NO
 - Models of sequence evolution: NO
 - Network distances and accuracy measures: NO
 - Methods and optimization problems for network inference: YES/NO

Where We Are Today

- Models of speciation: yes
- Models of sequence evolution: yes
- Network distances and accuracy measures: yes
- Methods and optimization problems for network inference: yes

Reconstruction Quality Model Phylogeny: 20-taxon 1-hybrid network



NeighborNet: False Positives



Open Problems in Hybrid Speciation

- Detecting reticulation
- Representing reticulate evolutionary scenarios
- Inferring reticulate evolution
- Visualization

Deciding Whether to Combine Datasets



Population Genetic Issues

- Population genetic reticulation masquerading as hybrid speciation
 - Meiotic recombination
 - Sexual recombination
- Lineage sorting
- Resolving this will require combining coalescent models with phylogenetic models

Lineage Sorting: Gene Tree/Species Tree









